

## Live projections of deceased artists: worship, representation, and immortality

### Projeções de artistas mortos: culto, representação e imortalidade

Roberto Tietzmann

Doctorate in Social Communication from PUCRS, BR. Professor and researcher of the postgraduate programs in Social Communication of the School of Communication, Arts, and Design and Creative Writing of the School of Humanities in PUCRS. Is coordinator of the research group ViDiCa, Digital and Audiovisual Culture, and Co-Coordinator of DaVint - interdisciplinary research laboratory of data visualization analysis. Teaches undergraduate disciplines on film editing and audiovisual production. Its primary interests are contact areas of audiovisual content, design, and technology. Orcid: <https://orcid.org/0000-0002-8270-0865>. Email: [rtietz@gmail.com](mailto:rtietz@gmail.com).

Samara Kalil

Doctorate candidate in Social Communication (PUCRS); Master in Social Communication (Pontifícia Universidade Católica do Rio Grande do Sul, RS, Brazil - PUCRS), Specialist in Journalism with emphasis on New Media Management (ESPM), Journalist (Universidade de Passo Fundo – UPF). Performs research around imagery representations involving technology, such as holograms, projections and augmented reality. Member of ViDiCa research group, worked as a professor at the Federal University of Rondônia (Unir) and is an invited professor at the UPF in the Specialization Course in Journalism in Digital media. Orcid: <http://orcid.org/0000-0003-3162-3799>. E-mail: [samarakalil@gmail.com](mailto:samarakalil@gmail.com).

#### Abstract:

This article investigates the imaginary borders of life and death present in the music entertainment industry from a selection of 3 shows based on 2D and 3D natural scale projections of deceased singers: Tupac Shakur (2012), Cazuza (2013), Michael Jackson (2014). The projections, according to Hofer (2011), are manifested as metalepsis that call into question the effect of presence without the artist, continuing the trend of using screens on stages. Debray (1993) affirms that the relation of the image with death comes from cults to ancestors, attempting to extend life through visual representations. In this way, we understand that within the “hologram” show format, there is a significant indicator of the transformations in the way the dead are represented.

#### Keywords:

Hologram; Projections; Metalepsis; Live entertainment; Deceased artists.

#### Resumo:

Este artigo investiga as fronteiras imaginárias entre a vida e a morte presentes na indústria do entretenimento musical a partir de uma seleção de 3 shows baseados em projeções em 2D e 3D, em escala natural, dos cantores: Tupac Shakur (2012), Cazuza (2013), Michael Jackson (2014). Uma nova maneira de lidar com o capital simbólico dos artistas mortos nos leva a considerar as imagens como representações simbólicas. As projeções, segundo Hofer (2011), se manifestam como metalepses que põe em causa o efeito da presença sem a presença do artista de fato, seguindo a tendência do uso de telas em espetáculos. Debray (1993) diz que a relação da imagem com a morte vem dos cultos e da antepassados, na tentativa de sua sobrevivência, pela imagem.

Dessa forma, entendemos que dentro do formato “holograma” de apresentação, há um indicador significativo das transformações na maneira como mortos são representados.

**Palavras-chave:**

Holograma; Projeções; Metalepse; Entretenimento ao vivo; Artistas falecidos.

## 1 Introduction

The live appearance of an artist has long been considered as a focal point of the performing arts like music, theatre, dance, mime, among others. Common sense affirms that the interchange of attention and affects between the performer and the audience is believed to enable a heightened experience. Intensity and communion go hand in hand according to this, attracting the further attention of the viewers that consume the live recordings to get one step closer to those moments of presence, even if in a massively reproduced copy. Aging and deceased artists pose a significant problem to scenarios like this, as the communal aspect of a public performance could no longer be thoroughly restaged.

Music shows from the second decade of the 21st century on have begun to incorporate life-sized projections of deceased artists on their tours, offering a technological and theoretical twist on the meaning of “live performance.” This application is foreshadowed by Debray (1993, p. 20) who states that “the birth of the image is involved with death.” The author tours the history of humankind, verifying that physical death was the first channel for the creation of a plastic imagination (or the birth of art), whether on the cave walls, in the tombs, in the graves, in the funeral urns or the statues present on Gravestones. However, as Debray recalls, most of the productions were not to be seen by the living, such as the pyramids of Egypt, which were closed, and only those en route to the afterlife were supposed to see the visuals.

Today such images are exposed as a novelty, and eager fans revel in the effect of presence created by such practices. For Debray (1993, p. 29) this is an ambiguous presence/absence. It creates such restlessness that the living need a countermeasure, that would be the “image of the unspeakable, a double of the dead to keep you alive and, by indirect effect, let you see this what is not-know-what in you, cease to be

yourself as almost nothing," in an allusion to a Mirroring of those who stay and in an almost liberating process in the making of the image of the other: "We oppose the decomposition of death to recomposing by the image" (1993, p. 30). It is through this so tenuous relationship between death, life and the image that we observe is constructed the logic of millennial anxieties with the cutting-edge technologies of current digital imagery.

In this chapter the authors question the borders between life and death present in the music entertainment industry observing the recordings of three shows based on 2D and 3D natural scale projections of deceased singers: the rapper Tupac Shakur (2012), the Brazilian pop star Cazuza (2013), and the 'king of pop' Michael Jackson (2014). Considering such performances as symbolic representations with formats and meanings in constant flux, we understand that the projections, according to Hofer (2011), are manifested as metalepsis that calls into question the effect of presence without the actual existence of the artist, a strategy of overcoming death through images as defined by Debray (1993). Such shows use technologies derived from ancient stagecraft and cinematic visual effects, improving on the long history of screens on stages reported by Dixon (2010). In this way, we understand that in such presentation format, there is a significant indicator about the transformations in the way the dead are represented and about how death retakes primitive meanings related to eternity and immortality in contemporaneity.

## **2 Crossing borders between life and death on performances and technologies**

In a sense, every recording can perpetuate a performance through time despite the eventual death of the artists involved. This is something expected by performers and audiences alike, and a consensual part of the status quo of the entertainment and creative markets. If we could pinpoint what's new on the subject discussed in this chapter, its novelty resides in the sensorial richness of the experience and the

perception of a metalepsis between artist, audience and the live staging of the performance.

This stage presence of the deceased artists has been a long time coming. In fact, it got widespread attention in the early 90s with the duet by Natalie Cole and her late father Nat King Cole in the breakthrough recording of the song Unforgettable<sup>1</sup>. Released in 1992 to great success it featured both generations of artists singing together in perfect harmony in a music video that showed the simultaneity of presence in some of the shots through the use of visual effects. Most of the shots, however, use other means to evoke the contact between the living and the dead. Archival footage, family photos, vintage-looking animation and shape morphing, are used to connect past and present. The varied imagery is bookended by Natalie's performance on an empty dust-covered house, yet another suggestion visual suggestion of memory, longing, and recollection. The different visual strategies used by the music video to connect the old and the new hinted that there was still work to be done on the images, even if the music, voice, and mixing had already reached a level of quality that made impossible to the average listener to distinguish the temporal seams.

Visual effects have been present in movies since its early years. Such techniques were able to create images that would be difficult, very expensive, very dangerous or unfeasible to produce by other means. Reading from the concepts of visual effects expressed in Aumont & Marie (2006), Fielding (1985), Goulekas (2001), Katz (1998), Mitchell (2004), Netzley (2000), Pinteau (2004), Rickitt (2000), Wilkie (1996) we convey the idea that the effects create images that replace those captured directly by a camera, through techniques performed on the set or in post-production. Although it is common sense to point out the presence of such resources in fantasy films or science fiction, in this chapter, we discuss its applications in the creation of an effect of presence that blurs the boundaries between presence and absence.

The same visual effects technologies used in the Unforgettable music video also been seen on other contents released around that time. A television ad for Diet

---

<sup>1</sup> UNFORGETTABLE live. Performers: Natalie Cole And Nat King Cole. Music: Unforgettable. 1992. Color. Recording available on YouTube's RoundMidnightTV channel. Available at: <https://youtu.be/CCX1xUdMsNs>. Retrieved: 25 Apr. 2018.

Coke from 1991 featured a performance by Elton John<sup>2</sup> on a nightclub visited by actors Humphrey Bogart, James Cagney, and the trumpeter Louis Armstrong, all extracted through rotoscoping from archival footage, matched to their surroundings and colorized to mix and interact with the rest of the cast. The feature film *Forrest Gump*<sup>3</sup>, released in 1994, recounted four decades of North American history mixing the eponymous protagonist with historical figures and events in seamless shots. Other, more recent, musical examples that gained less media attention were the duet between Celine Dion and Elvis Presley<sup>4</sup> on the *American Idol* reality show, in 2007, and once again Elvis Presley and Martina McBride singing *Blue Christmas*<sup>5</sup>, in 2008, among others.

Among all such examples, it is possible to observe a constant pattern: a deceased artist is always matched with a living one. Whenever present, music is defined by the late singer, the song is part of a known repertoire; there is never physical contact between the artists neither some spontaneous, unscripted action. The connection between past and present is articulated, as Hofer (2011) puts it, through a metalepsis, where a “strange” element is inserted on a different setting, either a living artist on a previous recording or a deceased one on a new one. Ironically, in an echo of Comte's positivism, the dead shape the form of the new content, because their recordings can be edited in a limited way.

Also, all the examples quoted so far had been created for and presented to audiences on screens, either on television and movie theaters. Although we are not downplaying the creative and technical challenges involved in the creation of such contents, creating to the screen happens on a homogeneous space, where the conventions of audiovisual representation involved mediate the expectations of the

---

<sup>2</sup> DIET Coke Commercial Elton John. Realization of The Coca-Cola Company. 1991. Son., B & W. Recording video available on musickeys8's YouTube channel. Available at: <https://youtu.be/b0lkSBNfYCQ>. Retrieved: 25 Apr. 1986.

<sup>3</sup> FORREST Gump - Trailer. Directed by Robert Zemeckis. 1994. Color. Available at: <https://youtu.be/bLvqoHBptjg>. Retrieved: 25 Apr. 2018.

<sup>4</sup> ELVIS & Celine Dion - If I Can Dream (A remastered version of the duet). Production of American Idol. Performers: Elvis Presley And Celine Dion. Music: If I Can Dream. 2007. Son., Color. Recording available on the navlestreng channel. Available at: <https://youtu.be/UmXHkL3xiMU>. Retrieved: 25 Apr. 2018.

<sup>5</sup> ELVIS Presley, Martina McBride - Blue Christmas. Performers: Elvis Presley And Martina McBride. Music: Blue Christmas. 2008. B & W. Record of the video posted on ElvisPresleyVEVO channel, YouTube. Available at: <https://youtu.be/3KK6sMo8NBY>. Retrieved: 25 Apr. 2018.

audiences. The recording of a live performance is not expected to shatter the boundaries of a screen, however intense the act may be.

Part of the technical and creative problem resides on the ambition to match camera-shot footage through the years using distinct technologies. Nuances of color balance, image texture, latitude of exposition, frame shape and motion representation have a wide variety of features, conditioned to the production choices on each circumstance. The use of more homogeneous sources, as an all-cartoon band, would articulate the metalepsis in an ironic fashion, attempting to bring animation outside the screen boundaries without using character costumes.

Hofer (2011) points out that in 2005, the band Gorillaz was considered a pioneer when performed for the first time a live 2D/hologram show, because it is a group formed by animated figures, that is, that do not exist on the physical plane. Hofer (2011) affirms the show "had only been made possible with the use of video projectors and transparent foil, and the band, who appeared to be standing on stage, were pretty much 'smoke and mirrors' - an artificially created optical illusion" (p. 232). In the case of the Gorillaz, the optical illusion was so convincing that the 2D animation appeared to gain depth when performing on the stage.

The illusion and the metalepsis walk together on stage since there is always an ontological clash of images involved in the phenomenon which, for the most part, exists on a controlled part of the material world. Such mix of material reality and visual fiction appeals to the active involvement of the audience to make-believe the juxtaposition of elements willingly or the "spectators' shared expectations, experiences and conventions they agree on" (HOFER, 2011, p. 243). Of course, this does not change the fact that the band's cartoon characters are not alive and in the flesh, but it does give us this illusion (HOFFER, 2008, p. 240). However, it is sporadic for a high level of metalepsis. What is observed, according to Hofer (2011) is a form of play with levels that remain compatible with rational explanations that enable self-deception for a short period.

As Hofer (2011), the way the representation is perceived and behaves can be categorized in different ways and levels. The level zero (0) would be considered the "ground level" or "real world," occupied by the audience. The physical artist/real

person would be in a slightly more fictional degree, Level One (1), where the subject plays a role in a performance. Level two (2) would be the projection of an artist who exists in the real world. At level three (3) and (4) are forms of stage animation/illusion. We suggest this conceptual frame can add a fifth level (5) that would be the projection of footage of a deceased artist prepared to create an effect of presence onstage.

Belting (2015) proposes to study the images in progress employing a new type of iconology, linking the past and the present of the life of the images. The author works with an approach around three terms or large categories – image, medium, and body – which together enable the reading of other iconic determinants, left unexplored before. Belting (2015) suggested an anthropological approach to understanding the images, stating that the current observations on the images lacks understanding about what the images are and how they circulate.

Thus, both the image and its medium are crucial to understanding the images today. The medium, in the case, makes the role of carrier or host. That way, Belting (2015, p. 155) states that "there are no visible images that arrive without mediation" and a delicate matter related to the materiality of the images is brought: "Physical images are physical due to the means they use, but the physical can no longer explain current technologies" (BELTING, 2015, p. 155). Therefore, materiality in itself is insufficient to understand the contemporary images, as the metalepsis that put into question the effect of presence without the presence of the artist in itself.

Such illusions are often mentioned as “hologram” shows or performances, and this is an incorrect term, although one that is grounded on the common sense of what a hologram would look like. We argue that such expectations were defined in the popular culture by the first movie of the franchise Star Wars, Episode IV - A New Hope, released in 1977 to great success according to Wyndham (2010). In a key scene, the robot R2-D2 plays a so-called doll-sized hologram of Princess Leia Organa (Carrie Fisher) to Luke Skywalker (Mark Hamill) and Obi-Wan Kenobi (Alec Guinness), begging for help against the antagonists, an event that puts in motion the central themes of the plot. Leia’s character is shown through a projection from a lens on the robot's body (the light beam is evident) in three distinct camera positions, suggesting she could be seen from any other point around. The camera does not change position, focus or

framing while these shots play, indicating that each image's composition visual effect was specifically created. The idea that a hologram depends on some projection apparatus, presents animated images, shows people on a full body shot and emulates presence was defined by this fictional scene. Or, as Richardson and Wilshire (2018) put it:

During the era of the original release of George Lucas's epic Star Wars films, as previously mentioned, the authors recall that holographers were inundated with requests to duplicate the effect shown in the scene where robot R2-D2 projected a 3D animated image of Leia (with sound!). But although labelled "a hologram", this imaginary technique does not fit easily into the scientific definition of Gabor's method of 3D imaging. (RICHARDSON; WILTSHIRE, 2018, p. 17)

A real hologram, as proposed by its creator Dennis Gabor should be the recording of a light field that under adequate lighting could be seen from all angles. In the case of the current projections discussed in this chapter, there is a set of projectors, mirrors and a transparent screen that create the illusion in the stages. They descend from nineteenth-century theatrical tricks.

The use of technological resources to create visuals that helped the staging of the narratives grew from the eighteenth century onwards, with the incorporation of free moving boxes, trap doors and other mechanical solutions that would collaborate with operas and other shows as indicated by Bianconi, Pestelli, and Singleton (2002). Miller (2006) and Ruffles (2004) argue that nineteenth-century theater in the pre-cinema decades regularly used lightning, rainbow, flood, fire, and smoke on stage. According to the authors, they were many spectacles incorporating apparitions and spirits realized through various projections with devices derived from magical lanterns.

A pioneer in modern stage magic, Jean Eugène Robert-Houdin, pursued a new path by claiming in his biography to have built a theater devoted to magic in Paris, full of devices to help perform the tricks while relying "on a simple stage, unimpeded by the paraphernalia of the ordinary magician" (ROBERT-HOUDIN, 1859, p. 271). The illusionist's intention to leave his stage freer contains within himself an idea of transparency that fosters verisimilitude, expressed in the simplicity of presentation of the tricks without being possible to attribute them to a machine. At the same time, a stage magic show has a tenuous or non-existent narrative; it is more performance than

a story. For this genre of presentations, the discourse that regulates relevance to the story becomes that of not revealing or making apparent how the trick is done, hiding the processes that execute it, and thus overcoming the limitations imposed by the laws of physics in the eyes of the audiences, something that echoes contemporary “hologram” shows.

### **3 The returning acts of Tupac Shakur, Cazuzza and Michael Jackson**

In this section three performances will be described and discussed: Tupac Shakur on Coachella (2012), Cazuzza on GVT Music Live (2013) and Michael Jackson on the Billboard Music Awards (2014). The criteria of choice for these three were based on their similarities and differences alike. As similar points, all three were performances carried before a broad audience, all featured variations of the same projection technique, “brought to life” a deceased artist and gained ample media coverage around their release. As diverging points, we highlight the different audiences’ profiles (two were music festivals, one was an awards ceremony) and the cultural aspects (one Brazilian singer, two American ones). The sample chosen is not exhaustive in scope but enough to identify and discuss the phenomenon.

The three artists selected are male singers from different musical genres: Rap, Rock, and Pop, respectively. While alive, they built solid and critically acclaimed careers with public recognition. They performed countless times in live presentations, with abundant audio and video recordings. They were accompanied by the media carefully and transformed into evergreen icons after their death. In this sense, the artists chosen did perform and invest in the public acknowledgment of their personas when performing.

It is also important to note that our contact with the shows was through recorded videos of the performances posted on the Internet by the production companies and relevant sources. It is, therefore, a second-degree observation, since the authors were not physically present at the place where the presentations took place. This extra layer of mediation is believed to transform the experience of watching the

performances, “flattening” the show into something closer to a regular recording of an event. Given the ephemeral nature of the performances, we believe that this does not invalidate this research as the transmission and reception of symbolic images, with anthropological weight, are represented either way.

Therefore, we are considering the studies of Belting (2015, p. 163) on an iconic presence as a way of building a methodological pathway that can translate our efforts to understand the images of dead artists projected on stage live, in your symbolic perspective. In his anthropological perspective of the concept of image, the author understands that the images traditionally stem from the absence of the body, creating a different type of presence. The iconic presence, however, maintains the absence of a body and converts it into what a visible absence.

The images live on the paradox of representing the presence of an absence or vice versa (which also applies to telepresence in the current media). This paradox, in turn, is based on the practice of relating the presence with the visibility. The bodies are present because they are visible [...]. When missing bodies are visible in images, they use a vicarious visibility (BELTING, 2015, p. 163).

According to Belting (2015, p. 163), there is a need for an appropriate means for the visibility of a body to be visible, since the images are only present due to and through their media but representing an absence of which are images. "The here and now of an image, its presence, to a certain degree is based on the visual medium that it resides." Absence and presence are re-established: "The means are present as if they were bodies, while the images did not." The author points out: "The images are present in the media, but they represent an absence, which is visible. The animation means that we open the capacity of a medium for the transmission of images. "With this, he points out that there has been an introduction of abstraction in visual experience and that means are responsible. That is, "the spectacle obliges its audience to learn new techniques of perception and with this to dominate new techniques of representation (BELTING, 2015, p. 164). Therefore, within this idea, the author's methodology is to identify the middle, image and body triad by bringing up intermediary and intercultural issues for understanding the images.

The first example of this kind of show was the projection of rapper Tupac Shakur that took place at the 13th Coachella Festival in California in 2012, at the closing of the event. The deceased artist shared the stage with the rapper Snoop Dogg and the support band in the background. Together, they interpreted a sequence three of songs: *Come With Me*, *Gangsta Party* and *Hail Mary*. Tupac Shakur's projection, as with Princess Leia's projection in the first Star Wars franchise film, can be considered a milestone, both for the renewal of the same imagery related to holograms and form how entertainment appropriates techniques to move the industry using the fragile frontiers of postmortem. The construction of the rapper's image by computer animation matched synthetic thespians created for visual effects in movies, but the sense of presence onstage stirred the press and internet coverage.

A 5-minute video published on Snoop Dogg's Youtube Channel<sup>6</sup> synthesizes the performance. The camera is positioned facing the stage directly, recording at the beginning of the presentation Tupac's rise from a supposed trap door and cuts to a full shot of the stage as the music begins playing and the singer moves around to the audience reaction. The lights are dimmed, and the rapper appears to shine ethereally in front of a darkened stage where the occasional light from background instruments shines through the body.

The themes of absence and presence posed by Belting (2015) and Debray (1993) are addressed in the synthetic image in technical and symbolic terms. As the audience was comprised of many fans, every part of Tupac's performance should be able to match the characteristics already known. Thus, there's a wealth of details in the hologram image, from the abundant tattoos to the voice pitch and the way to move and occupy the stage space. It presents a representation of the rapper in the exact size, full body. As the performance progresses, songs are interspersed with calls to the audience reaching a choreographed closing duet with Snoop Dogg. The camera position remains constant, facing the stage frontally and hiding the projection mechanics involved. The proportions of both rappers onstage are consistent, although the light direction is

---

<sup>6</sup> Recording available on the official channel of rapper Snoop Dogg on YouTube: <https://youtu.be/TGbrFmPBV0Y>. Retrieved: 18 Apr. 2018. Hologram produced by Digital Domain Company.

slightly different, a point that did not seem to bother the audience. In the end, the Tupac disappears into a puff of smoke and light.

This angel-like way to close the show is touching and ironic at the same time. Tupac Shakur was dead for twelve years at the time of the show, and the press had widely covered his murder in the day. No anxious fans or conspiracy theorists did come up with a hypothesis of a secretive, hidden singer for such a long time after the Coachella show, and the performance was met with widespread recognition on technical and artistic grounds. We argue that the trap door stage entrance honors the legacy of Robert-Houdin's stage magic and the digital animation of the exit presents a closure that can reconcile the effect of presence with the tricks and limitations involved. To the audience's eyes, Tupac was there, even if Hofer's (2008) metalepsis was circumscribed by the ultimate limitations of joining animation and artists live on stage: Snoop Dogg could not hug or touch Tupac, neither could the late rapper reach for the audience in a stage mosh jump or ask for the lights to be raised to its full. The edge of the stage meant the edge of reality.

The second performance recording we observed was on the festival GVT Music Live's show of the late Brazilian singer-songwriter Cazuza, in 2013, in São Paulo, Brazil. The artist had had a successful career during the 80s, first with the Barão Vermelho rock band, and later in a more versatile solo career until his passing due to AIDS-related complications in 1990. Five songs featured the singer's projection, and the video recording analyzed featured one of them, *O tempo não pára* (Time does not stop), one of Cazuza's biggest hits with the duration of 5min06s, published on the official channel of GVT on YouTube<sup>7</sup>.

The show features a more elaborate set design than Tupac Shakur's performance. The holographic singer is joined on stage by a rock band along strings and metals in an orchestral musical arrangement, and the members of the band are carefully positioned under spotlights, to enhance the illusion. As in the first case commented in this chapter, the Brazilian singer is also represented by a computer animated image. In articles published in the press, the effects supervisors revealed the

---

<sup>7</sup> Recording available on the official channel of GVT on YouTube: <https://youtu.be/2ieTgQpzIYc>. Retrieved: 18 Apr. 2018. Hologram produced by the company 4DMotion.

techniques used in the performance. Before the construction of the 3D model, the movements of a cover actor impersonating Cazuza were digitally captured. A computerized image of the singer was modeled, and the motion captures were merged by a technique similar visual effects with animated characters or on Shakur. In the same fashion, when on stage, a projector reproduced the image in a mirror near the floor, which reflected in a transparent screen at a 45° angle.

The video cuts from shots of the animated singer to views of the audience singing along, the stage and sections of the band and its musicians. The camera position is always frontal or slightly diagonal to the stage. Is notable that Cazuza does not move around the stage, standing and dancing in the same spot. The quality, in technical terms, of the animation, is not as sophisticated as the previous example, and there are some inconsistencies in size and lighting when compared to other members of the band. The effect of presence is presented at the different levels, but the effect of metalepsis in the audience, apparently, does not reach the intensity of the previous installment. At the end of the song, the lights are dimmed, the avatar thanks the audience and disappears.

In the presentation of Michael Jackson, at the Billboard Music Awards 2014<sup>8</sup>, at the MGM Grand Garden Arena in Las Vegas, the song performed is Slave to the Rhythm and the recording of the performance with the duration of 3min57s. On a stage of a theater, the performance began with dancers in front of a curtain. It is possible in the first few seconds to view the audience, sitting somewhat bored, using cell phones.

The opening of the curtains reveals right in the center, the projection of a digitally constructed Michael Jackson sitting on a throne. He stands up, moves around and dances, both alone and interacting with other holograms. The live band of five members nearly not visible, as it is minimally illuminated. Other dancers also populate the performance, positioned on the sides and in the foreground of the stage. Dancers between the halls of the audience also performed at the time of the show. The image of the artist is brighter than the previous shows, what improves the general effect of

---

<sup>8</sup> Recording available on the Michael Jackson official channel on YouTube: <https://youtu.be/jDRTghGZ7XU>. Retrieved: 18 Apr. 2018. Hologram produced by companies Optimum Productions, Pulse Evolution and Tricycle Logic.

presence through the projection. Slight imperfections can be perceived, however: the visual aspect ratio of the artist's body, in a few moments, does not fit correctly; the design and synching of the artist's face with the music is slightly discomfiting, sliding the “Uncanny Valley” as defined by Mori, Macdorman e Kageki (2012) of avatars that are nearly human-like, but in this closeness resides the strangeness.

A fundamental difference in the last show that we observed was the audience reaction. While the first two performances took place in front of fans, a colder, more businesslike crowd did not seem to be overly impressed by the revived Michael Jackson. A sense of technical improvement over the pioneer performance by the rapper is evident, as the latest hologram also represents a shape-shifting set design and involves dancers on stage. However so, the sense of future business opportunities seemed to be the most significant value as artists become whole intellectual properties after death, even returning to the stage.

#### 4 Final considerations

The capability of sound and image recordings to extend the perception of life is part of common sense and has been widely used by the music industry to keep their stars and catalogs turning profits for years to come, in more than one platform as Martel (2012) charts. New technologies are appropriated continuously following this logic. Both series of rhythm and music digital games, as the Guitar Hero and Rock Band franchises, licensed the recordings and likenesses of musicians, allowing the players to impersonate their artists of choice onscreen. Deceased singers as Nirvana's Kurt Cobain or the Beatles' John Lennon<sup>9</sup> continue to perform this way. Future developments may involve Virtual Reality headsets in high image and sound resolution, a parallel path to attain the perception of being elsewhere.

Stage shows pose additional complexities to this repurposing of likenesses, as the scrutiny of the live audience is far more demanding than the ones in domestic video

---

<sup>9</sup> GUITAR Hero® 5 Kurt Cobain. Interpreter: Kurt Kobain. 2009. Son., color. Available in: <https://youtu.be/IpkiFe6lFHs>. Trailler. Retrieved: 3 may 2018.

games. More than discussing the technical specificities of each presentation, supported by the theories of Belting (2015) and Hofer (2011), we were able to point out that these deceased artists are digitally produced with the technological resources available in each circumstance, involving solutions aligned with the visual effects seen in feature films. The on stage screens described by Dixon (2010) become disguised, and thus try to hide their edges and expand their persuasion to the edge of the audience.

While the three examples observed in this chapter have been artists that have been long gone (Tupac, 12 years; Cazuzza, 23 years; Jackson, 5 years) the use of projections can be seen in other contents and contexts. In late april 2018, the Swedish pop group ABBA has announced to be planning a tour<sup>10</sup> based on the projection technologies, becoming one of the first living artists to propose “hologram” versions of themselves as the focal point of the show.

Japanese audiences follow the animated singer Hatsune Miku<sup>11</sup>, originally a character for voice synthesis technology, on tours featuring animated projections. The video game company Nintendo has produced a spinoff of the game Splatoon! as hologram shows featuring Callie and Marie, the characters known as the Squid Sisters<sup>12</sup>. In both cases, the artists are already animation characters *per se*, so there is no end of life, aging or measure of verisimilitude on their performances.

The audience’s desire to cherish the artists they admire creates the demand for such imagery to be created. The history of the projections, tricks and visual effects materializes the presence of absence caused by an artists’ passing through the audiences prompt attention with all its symbolic legacy through the image. It is an imagery niche that encompasses visual and sensory magic perfected by technology

---

<sup>10</sup> SAVAGE, Mark (Ed.). **Abba announce first new music since 1982**. 2018. From BBC News - Entertainment & Arts. Available in: <http://www.bbc.com/news/entertainment-arts-43924609>. Retrieved: 27 abr. 2018.

FRANCE, Lisa Respers (Ed.). **ABBA announces new music: Mamma Mia! ABBA is getting the band back together**. 2018. From CNN Entertainment. Available in: <https://edition.cnn.com/2018/04/27/entertainment/abba-new-music/index.html>. Retrieved: 27 abr. 2018.

<sup>11</sup> CRYPTON Future Media - Hatsune Miku -- World is Mine. Interpreter: Hatsune Miku. Music: World Is Mine. 2010. Son., color. Recording available in immersivetechnology channel on YouTube. Available in: <https://youtu.be/pEaBqjLeCu0>. Retrieved: 3 may 2018.

<sup>12</sup> SPLATOON – Squid Sisters - Live Concert at Niconico Tokaigi 2016. Interpreter: Callie & Marie. 2016. Son., color. This footage is from Callie and Marie’s first live performance at Niconico Tokaigi, a gaming event in Japan. Available in: <https://youtu.be/wxkKUbNnXKE>. Retrieved: 3 maio 2018.

that plays on the unbelievable. The levels of metalepsis blur past and present all times and however evident, the traces of falsehood are easily brushed away. Whenever music plays, the artists will be in the presence of their listeners.

## REFERENCES

AUMONT, Jacques; BERGALA, Alain; MARIE, Michel; VERNET, Marc. **A estética do filme (2a edição)**. Campinas: Papirus Editora, 2002.

BELTING, Hans. **Antropología de la imagen**. Madrid: Katz, 2010. 321 p.

BELTING, Hans. Imagen, medium, cuerpo: Un nuevo acercamiento a la iconología. **Cic Cuadernos de Información y Comunicación**, [s.l.], v. 20, n. 1, p.153-170, 4 Nov. 2015. Universidad Complutense de Madrid (UCM).  
[http://dx.doi.org/10.5209/rev\\_ciyc.2015.v20.49382](http://dx.doi.org/10.5209/rev_ciyc.2015.v20.49382). Available in:  
<https://revistas.ucm.es/index.php/CIYC/article/view/49382/45989>. Retrieved: 27 Jun. 2017.

BIANCONI, Lorenzo; PESTELLI, Giorgio; SINGLETON, Kate (Eds.). **Opera on Stage**. Chicago: The University of Chicago Press, 2002.

DEBRAY, Régis. **Vida e morte da imagem: uma história do olhar no ocidente**. Vozes: Rio de Janeiro, 1993.

DIXON, Steve. **Digital Performance: A History of New Media in Theater, Dance, Performance Art, and Installation**. Cambridge: MIT Press, 2010.

FIELDING, Raymond. **Techniques of Special Effects Cinematography**. Boston: Focal Press, 1985.

GOULEKAS, Karen. **Visual Effects in a Digital World: A Comprehensive Glossary of over 7000 Visual Effects Terms**. Los Angeles: Morgan Kaufmann, 2001. 600 p.

HOFER, Roberta. Metalepsis in Live Performance: Holographic Projections of the Cartoon Band "Gorillaz" as a Means of Metalepsis. In: KUKKONEN, Karin et al. **Metalepsis in Popular Culture**. Berlin/New York: Walter de Gruyter, 2011. Cap. 12. p. 232-251.

KATZ, Ephraim. **The Film Encyclopedia** (3rd Ed). Perennial, 1998.

MARTEL, Frédéric. **Mainstream: a guerra global das mídias e das culturas**. São Paulo, RJ: Civilização Brasileira, 2012.

MILLER, Ron. **SPECIAL EFFECTS – An Introduction to Movie Magic**. Minneapolis: Twenty-First Century Books, 2006.

MITCHELL, A.J. **Visual Effects for Film and Television**. Oxford: Focal Press, 2004.

MORI, Masahiro; MACDORMAN, Karl; KAGEKI, Norri. The Uncanny Valley [From the Field]. **Ieee Robotics & Automation Magazine**, [s.l.], v. 19, n. 2, p.98-100, jun. 2012. Institute of Electrical and Electronics Engineers (IEEE). <http://dx.doi.org/10.1109/mra.2012.2192811>.

NETZLEY, P. D. **Encyclopedia of Movie Special Effects**. Phoenix: Oryx Press, 2000.

PINTEAU, Pascal. **Special Effects: an oral history**. Nova Iorque: Harry N. Abrams, 2004.

RICHARDSON, Martin J.; WILTSHIRE, John D.. **The Hologram**. Hoboken, Nj: John Wiley & Sons, 2018. 330 p. Available in: <<https://www.wiley.com/en-us/The+Hologram:+Principles+and+Techniques-p-9781119088905>>. Retrieved: 10 Jan. 2018.

RICKITT, Richard. **Special Effects, the history and the technique**. Nova Iorque: Billboard Books, 2000.

ROBERT-HOUDIN, Jean Eugène. **Memoirs de Robert-Houdin Vol.1**. Londres: Chapman and Hall, 1859.

RUFFLES, Tom. **Ghost Images: Cinema Of the Afterlife**. Jefferson: McFarland & Company, 2004.

WILKIE, Bernard. **Creating Special Effects for Film and Television**. Boston: Focal Press, 1996.

WYNDHAM, Ryder. **Star Wars Year by Year: A Visual Chronicle**. Londres: Dorling Kindersley, 2010.

## VIDEO REFERENCES

#VOLTACAZUZA | Pra sempre Cazuza. Realização de Gvt Music Live. Música: O Tempo Não Para. 2013. (2 min. 55 s), son., color. Available in: <https://youtu.be/2ieTgQpziYc>. Retrieved: 18 Apr. 2018.

MICHAEL Jackson - Slave To The Rhythm. Direção de Jamie King. Produção de Joseph Davison. Interpreter: Michael Jackson. Music: Slave To The Rhythm. 2014.

(3 min. 57 seg.) Son., color. Série Gravação de vídeo postada no canal Michael Jackson, do YouTube. Available in: <https://youtu.be/jDRTghGZ7XU>. Retrieved: 25 Apr. 2018.

TUPAC Hologram Snoop Dogg and Dr. Dre Perform Coachella Live 2012. Direção de Dr. Dre. Música: With Me, Gangsta Party And Hail Mary. [si]: Digital Domain, 2012. (5 min.), son., color. Available in: <https://youtu.be/TGbrFmPBV0Y>. Retrieved: 18 Apr. 2018.

Recebido em: 20/09/2019

Aceito em: 24/10/2019